

Appendix A

Chronology – issues with MCCCCD Human Resources

July 6, 2017 – Paluzzi writes to Rio Salado College HR (Maria Bellino) to discuss issues with Associate General Manager and Chief Engineer pay grades under the new compensation & classification structure. (The new compensation structure would result in “red-lining” most of the senior leadership in the Rio Salado College Division of Public Service, which operates KJZZ and KBAQ. Red-lining means that these employees would not be able to receive pay raises, with the implication that they are currently overpaid.)

July 10, 2017 – Paluzzi writes to Maria Bellino to provide documentation as to why KJZZ and KBAQ are not just “campus radio stations,” and why the District needs to apply salary compensation that is consistent with major market public radio operations.

July 19, 2017 – Maria Bellino provides summary document to Paluzzi with language to be submitted to District HR to justify Paluzzi’s requests to correct the red-lining problems.

August 11, 2017 – Paluzzi writes to Maria Bellino to follow up on District HR’s failure to communicate regarding a request for an urgent temporary reassignment for Associate General Manager Linda Pastori.

August 14, 2017 – Maria Bellino writes to Paluzzi to explain why a radio station employee cannot be moved into a critical position (General Manager) due to elimination of the job description of General Manager in the job bank.

August 14, 2017 – Paluzzi responds to Maria Bellino questioning the District’s actions in eliminating radio station’s General Manager job description without consultation at the college or division level.

September 5, 2017 – Paluzzi writes to President Bustamante, expressing the need for urgent action to appoint a General Manager to the Sun Sounds radio station, now two months after issuing the request.

September 6-10, 2017 – In Mexico City with a delegation visiting KJZZ’s Mexico City Bureau and staff. This delegation included a member of the Maricopa County Community College District Board of Governors, one of seven publicly elected officials that control all ten community colleges in the county. During the visit, Paluzzi and other staff members briefed this board member on the problems that we were experiencing with District HR in general, and with the Compensation and Classification rollout in particular.

September 18, 2017 – Paluzzi receives a direct email from the Vice President, Board of Governors, Maricopa Community College District, asking Paluzzi specifically about “the disconnect between the actual jobs and the recommended classifications” in the District's new classification and compensation program.

September 19, 2017 – Paluzzi responds to Board Member’s request, highlighting problems that he has been encountering working with District HR in an effort to correct problems with the new compensation and classification system that has been demoralizing his senior staff members.

September 25, 2017 – President Bustamante writes to Paluzzi to advise him that he has raised Paluzzi’s salary “because of the fabulous job you are doing...and still doing.”

October 10, 2017 – Paluzzi writes to Maria Bellino to challenge District HR to make a change in their new compensation grade for Sun Sounds General Manager Linda Pastori to avoid yet another employee being red-lined.

October 20, 2017 – Paluzzi writes to Anna Flores (Rio Salado Human Resources) to ask for assistance in getting District HR to approve hiring a replacement for the retiring Executive Director of Friends of Public Radio Arizona. District had delayed responding to this request in a timely manner.

October 28, 2017 – Paluzzi receives a direct email from the Vice President, Board of Governors, Maricopa Community College District. Paluzzi was asked to review a response that the Board Member received from Chancellor Maria Harper-Marinick and LaCoya Sheldon-Johnson, Vice-Chancellor, District Human Resources. Paluzzi was asked to review for “significant discrepancies.”

October 29, 2017 – Paluzzi provides Board Member with a first level response to the request. In this memo (see Appendix C titled “October 29 memo”), Paluzzi asserts that District HR has made a false representation to the Board Member, and further alleges an inequity between how the new Classification and Compensation system treats IT Engineers versus Broadcast Engineers.

October 30, 2017 – Paluzzi provides Dr. Thor with a second level response to her request. In this memo (see Appendix D titled “October 30 memo”) Paluzzi outlines several discrepancies between the information that District Human Resources provided through Chancellor Harper Marinick ... and actual fact.

November 13, 2017 – Paluzzi provides to President Bustamante a copy of the response provided to Dr. Thor that details several misrepresentations between the information provided to Dr. Thor by Vice Chancellor LaCoya Sheldon-Johnson and Chancellor Maria Harper Marinick and the facts (see Appendix E, “Complete Response”).

December, 2017 – Investigation begins on Paluzzi, in conjunction with an investigation of fellow Vice President LeRodrick Terry. Source, AZCentral news story (May 4, 2018, attached). Information further corroborated during first interview of Paluzzi by investigator Jean Wilcox on March 14, 2018.

January, 2018 – During an away trip to Hermosillo, Mexico (where KJZZ is constructing a new News Bureau), employee [REDACTED] demonstrated abnormal behavior (excessive consumption of alcohol). Paluzzi reported this to President Bustamante and Maria Bellino.

February, 2018 – [REDACTED] demonstrated additional abnormal behavior, [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Then, he used the all staff email system to send photos [REDACTED] [REDACTED] to every staff member. At the direction of Rio Salado Human Resources, Paluzzi wrote a reprimand and cited a violation of District policy [REDACTED]

March 2, 2018 – One of Employee #3's direct reports files a complaint against him.

March 13, 2018 – Paluzzi receives a package containing a complaint against Employee #3 by a former student and part-time employee who worked with him, alleging sexual harassment in September, 2017.

March 14, 2018 – Paluzzi meets with District hired independent investigator Jean Wilcox (an attorney from Prescott, AZ). Wilcox, in her email to Paluzzi, says that the purpose of the meeting was to discuss allegations against Employee #3. At the end of a 90 minute meeting, Wilcox adds that Paluzzi has also been under investigation as part of the LeRodrick Terry investigation, but that she could find no evidence of harassment on Paluzzi's part having interviewed 20 people.

April 5, 2018 – Investigator Jean Wilcox requests another meeting with Paluzzi. The interview lasts more than 90 minutes. The first 20 minutes of the interview was a follow-up on questions relating to Employee #3's behavior. The remaining time focused on a variety of questions regarding Paluzzi's actions that focused on journalistic ethics, self-defense training, travel with staff on a crowded Mexican bus, and sexual harassment.

April 9, 2018 – Paluzzi leaves for Spain to lead a KJZZ Flavors of Spain Tour with ten KJZZ members as a fund raiser for the station.

May 2, 2018 – Paluzzi returns from Spain.

May 3, 2018 – Paluzzi meets with Rio Salado President Bustamante for a previously scheduled briefing meeting. Upon arrival at the President's office,

Bustamante advises Paluzzi that there is someone in his office. That person is MCCCCD Associate General Counsel, Employment, Samantha Blevins. Paluzzi is told that he is to be placed on paid administrative leave due to allegations of sexual harassment. Paluzzi asks for a description of the harassment allegations, but is denied. Blevins tells Paluzzi that he can resign on the spot, and all of the allegations remain confidential. However, if he refuses, charges will be drawn, and the report from investigator Wilcox will be released through the Freedom of Information Act.

Appendix B

Documentation



July 6 memo: Meeting Request

1 message

Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi@rioradio.org>

Thursday, July
6 at 4:05 PM

To: Maria Bellino

Hi Maria,

I talked with Dr. Bustamante this morning. He would like for you and I to get together as soon as possible to discuss:

1. the Associate General Manager class
2. the Chief Engineer pay grade
3. a direct appointment request to he will be forwarding to District

He feels that we need to attempt to thoroughly explore the first two issues through channels first. If we cannot obtain a response or resolution within a week or so, he will need to escalate the issue to the VC or the Chancellor..

I will be available on Monday after 11am. Please let me know your availability, and thanks!

Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627**

On Thu, Jul 6, 2017 at 9:22 AM, Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@>wrote:

Jim, this was the response I received from Kathy Brooks. Let's discuss further.



Maria R. Bellino, MSIO
Dean, Administrative & Employee Services
Tel: (480) 517-8220 | Fax: (480) 517-8149 | maria.bellino@
2323 W. 14th Street Tempe, AZ 85281 | www.

A Maricopa Community College

**Summer Hours: 5/15/17 - 8/11/17: Mon-Thurs
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., closed Fridays**

On Thu, Jul 6, 2017 at 7:19 AM, Kathy Brooks <kathy.brooks@domail.> wrote:

Maria,

Please ask Jim to send us something in writing to articulate his need. He can use the management reconsideration form that we sent out. We unfortunately don't have the bandwidth to hold meetings with everyone wanting something to be considered. We will be happy to review his request but you should weigh in on it and agree with it prior to sending our way. Do keep in mind however that the reconsideration period, management or employee is intended only for classification reconsideration, not pay.

Thanks,
Kathy



Kathy Brooks, SPHR, SHRM-SCP
Associate Vice-Chancellor, HR Administration
2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281

Tell us how we're doing!
phone | 480-731-8441 fax | 480-731-8484
email | kathy.brooks@domail.
website | <https://www.maricopa.edu>

On Wed, Jul 5, 2017 at 5:47 PM, Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@>wrote:

Kathy, thank you for the quick response and for the titling accommodation. We would still appreciate the opportunity to meet as the VP Public Services, John Paluzzi is requesting this discussion. We can come to the District if it is more convenient for you.



Maria R. Bellino, MSIO

Dean, Administrative & Employee Services

Tel: (480) 517-8220 | Fax: (480) 517-8149 | maria.bellino@

2323 W. 14th Street Tempe, AZ 85281 | www.

A Maricopa Community College

**Summer Hours: 5/15/17 - 8/11/17: Mon-Thurs
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., closed Fridays**

On Wed, Jul 5, 2017 at 5:44 PM, Kathy Brooks <kathy.brooks@domail.> wrote:

Maria,

We are able to accommodate the move from Assistant to Associate - Broadcast Associate General Manager. We are not, however, in a place to entertain appeals for the grade a classification is assigned to. Remember we are moving to a market based system and we are using only the data sources outlined in the "past study resources" on class comp corner which includes both public and private sector employers. By moving to market it should be understood that it could result in higher, lower or similar pay ranges for individual employees compared to the current pay plans. Let us know if further questions.

Thanks,
Kathy



Kathy Brooks, SPHR, SHRM-SCP

Associate Vice-Chancellor, HR Administration

2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281

Tell us how we're doing!

phone | 480-731-8441 fax | 480-731-8484

email | kathy.brooks@domail.

website | <https://www.maricopa.edu>

On Wed, Jul 5, 2017 at 4:00 PM, Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@>wrote:

He has questions and wants to provide feedback regarding the Broadcast Assistant General Manager and the Broadcast Engineering Chief classification. The question

with the Broadcast Assistant General Managers is regarding the absence of a Broadcast Associate General Manager and corresponding grade. as is common within this industry, unlike the "Assistant" general manager. The inquiry regarding the Engineering Chief is regarding the level/pay range of this position.

These inquiries did not surface before as the pay range was not available until now.

Thank you



Maria R. Bellino, MSIO
Dean, Administrative & Employee Services
Tel: (480) 517-8220 | Fax: (480) 517-8149
2323 W. 14th Street Tempe, AZ 85281

A Maricopa Community College

**Summer Hours: 5/15/17 - 8/11/17:
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., closed Friday.**

On Wed, Jul 5, 2017 at 3:50 PM, Kathy Brooks <kathy.brooks@domail.> wrote:

Maria,

Can you give us an idea what he is wanting to discuss? Could this be done by phone?

Thanks,
Kathy



Kathy Brooks, SPHR, SHRM-SCP
Associate Vice-Chancellor, HR Administration
2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281

Tell us how we're doing!
phone | 480-731-8441 fax | 480-731-8484
email | kathy.brooks@domail.
website | <https://www.maricopa.edu>

On Wed, Jul 5, 2017 at 3:42 PM, Maria

Bellino <maria.bellino@> wrote:

Is it possible
for Jim
Paluzzi and I
to meet with
all or one of
you tomorrow
afternoon
regarding a
couple of his
positions
within the
Radio
Station?
Please
advise.



Maria R. Bellino, MSIO
Dean, Administrative & Employee Ser
Tel: (480) 517-8220
2323 W. 14th Street

A Maricopa Community College

Summer Hours:
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., cl

M Gmail

Paluzzi 000021

July 10 memo: Reconsideration for Program Directors

1 message

Jim Paluzzi
To: Maria Bellino

July 10, 2017 at 8:33 PM

Maria, thanks for the materials! I will get back with you tomorrow on those items.

Here is a quick look at how our network stacks up against other major markets. For your information, metro Phoenix is 14th largest broadcast market in the country.

KJZZ raises 95% of its own funding (total budget in excess of \$13 million.) As you can see from the attached powerpoint, the Division differs significantly in size from the other public radio stations in the state.

Only two public radio stations in the country have a full audience research department (Minnesota Public Radio and Rio Salado).

No other public radio station in the U.S. operates a fully staffed international news bureau (KJZZ's Mexico City Bureau).

No other public radio station in the U.S. operates a fully staffed youth media center: (KJZZ's **Spot 127 East Valley Youth Media Center and Spot 127 West Valley Youth Media Center**).

No other public radio station in the country operates a fully equipped mobile production unit *and* food truck: Soundbite.

Rio's Division of Public Service operates the largest radio reading service in the country for the blind and print handicapped, with more than 500 volunteers serving 50,000 listeners weekly.

As you can see, the Division of Public Service is much more than a campus radio station in every way: size, scope, community impact, budget, staff size, budget size, variety of differentiated services, and international coverage. The level of complexity of the Division is matched by only a handful of public radio stations in the country in the largest markets.

I hope you find this information useful. Please advise should you have any questions, comments, concerns ... or you should need additional information

and documentation.

Thanks!

Jim

James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627

On Mon, Jul 10, 2017 at 5:35 PM, Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@>wrote:

Jim, please review the attached. As previously discussed I will need the part-time staff names and position titles. Also, if there are currently positions posted for KJZZ that will report to any of these individuals, please advise.

I look forward to receiving the information related to the Radio's current standing that depicts specific information and focuses on the uniqueness for KJZZ/KBAQ. This will also assist in conducting research regarding other stations and their salaries.



Maria R. Bellino, MSIO

Dean, Administrative & Employee Services

Tel: (480) 517-8220 | Fax: (480) 517-8149 | maria.bellino@

2323 W. 14th Street Tempe, AZ 85281 | www.

A Maricopa Community College

Summer Hours: 5/15/17 - 8/11/17: Mon-Thurs
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., closed Fridays

M Gmail

July 19 memo: Reconsideration for Program Director

1 message

Paluzzi 000023

Jim Paluzzi
To: Maria Bellino

Wednesday, Jul 19, 2017 at 5:50 PM

Jim, before I interject these paragraphs in these documents can you review for content? Thanks...M

The basis for this request for review considers comparisons to market and the data collected for this position reclassification. The final allocation report provided to Rio Salado College indicates this employee was placed in a Broadcast Assistant General Manager position. However since there is no Broadcast Assistant General Manager job description, we are assuming that this position was placed in the Broadcast Associate General Manager position, Job Code 10405, pay grade 119. The type and level of work being performed by this employee at this radio station is better described in the Program Director job description, job code 1170, and pay grade 121. Additionally, Rio Salado College disagrees with the "benchmarking" compensation practice for this position and the outcome of matching this position to external jobs that have similar job content from third party survey sources.

KJZZ, K-BACH, Sun Sounds of Arizona and SPOT 127 are award-winning national public radio (NPR) stations and a youth media center. KJZZ and KBAQ, operate as a public service and are principally public-supported, providing local, national, and international news, information, and culturally enriching programming for the citizens of Maricopa County. The attached slide deck is provided to demonstrate the comparison of KJZZ/KBAQ with other NPR stations in Arizona, and other comparisons across the nation.

KJZZ/KBAQ have an operating budgeting six times the size of the next largest NPR station in Arizona. KBAQ has the largest audience share of any classical public radio station in the top 20 markets nationwide. When considering the 23 AM and 40 FM stations in the Phoenix area, if each station had the same audience share, the average share would be 1.6%. However, currently KBAQ has a 3.4 share and KJZZ has a 2.6 share, and a combined share of 6.0, which is 400% higher than the average

1.6%. Every day, nearly 200,000 people tune to either KJZZ or KBAQ, which is greater than the entire population of Flagstaff and Yuma combined.

It is notable that the 2010 to 2013 U.S. Census Bureau reflects the population growth in Phoenix to be in the top 12 cities. Other cities include Denver, Seattle and Dallas. Complimenting this growth is KJZZ/KBAQ's annual budget, greater than 13 million, and within the top 12 public radio organizations and only 10 other radio stations have a larger news team than KJZZ. Also attached to this request are Form 990's that support the pay comparison for like positions in this job market.

The level of work being performed by KJZZ/KBAQ when considering this data is higher level and more complex than the Broadcast Associate General Manager job description. Specifically, the Program Director references "multiple business units" versus "general operations and management." The work that is performed in multiple business units is principle and paramount.



Maria R. Bellino, MSIO

Dean, Administrative & Employee Services

Tel: (480) 517-8220 | Fax: (480) 517-8149 | maria.bellino@

2323 W. 14th Street Tempe, AZ 85281 | www.

A Maricopa Community College

**Summer Hours: 5/15/17 - 8/11/17: Mon-Thurs
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., closed Fridays**

On Tue, Jul 11, 2017 at 3:50 PM, Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi2@rioradio.> wrote:

Maria, I have reviewed all five documents, and have attached them with minor edits.

I will get the RPS information to you tomorrow.

Also, I now have salary data for these positions from a most reliable source: the IRS!

I will drop them off at your office right now.

Thanks!

Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public
Service |Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627**

On Mon, Jul 10, 2017 at 5:35 PM, Maria
Bellino <maria.bellino@> wrote:

Jim, please review the attached. As previously discussed I
will need the part-time staff names and position titles.
Also, if there are currently positions posted for KJZZ that
will report to any of these individuals, please advise.

I look forward to receiving the information related to the Radio's
current standing that depicts specific information and focuses on the
uniqueness for KJZZ/KBAQ. This will also assist in conducting
research regarding other stations and their salaries.



Maria R. Bellino, MSIO
Dean, Administrative & Employee Services
Tel: (480) 517-8220 | Fax: (480) 517-8149 | maria.bellino@
2323 W. 14th Street Tempe, AZ 85281 | www.

A Maricopa Community College

**Summer Hours: 5/15/17 - 8/11/17: Mon-Thurs
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., closed Fridays**



August 11 memo: Any News?

1 message

Jim Paluzzi
To: Maria Bellino

Friday, Aug 11, 2017 at 11:25 AM

Hello Maria. Just checking in to see if you have heard anything regarding the

temporary reassignment for Linda Pastori. We are well past the ten day service standard for District to approve these requests.

Also, do we have any news regarding the President's direct appointment allocations?

I know that Chris would like us to work through channels. However, if those channels are broken, please let me know if you think it's time for me to take these items directly to the president.

Thanks so much, y que tengas un buen fin de semana :)

Best regards

Jim

Sent from my BlackBerry - the most secure mobile device



August 14 memo

1 message

Maria Bellino

To: James Paluzzi

August 14, 2017 at
8:52AM

Jim, buenos dias!!

I spoke with the District late on Thursday and could not convince them regarding the General Manager temp reassignment for Linda as the position no longer exists in our current job description job bank, although it exists in the Class and Comp rollout. I did inquire about the direct hire allocations and

I was advised they are pending. I inquired if we could do a direct hire to the new general manager position and they are considering. I will contact them again today. I'm sorry it is not better news.



MARIA R. BELLINO, MSIO
RIO SALADO COLLEGE

Dean, Administrative & Employee Services

Rio Salado College 2323 W. 14th St

4805178220 | maria.bellino@

<https://www.riosalado.edu/>



August 14 memo 2

1 message

Jim Paluzzi

August 14 at 2:28
PM

To: Maria Bellino

Jim, please see my responses in red. So, three questions:

1. Can they do that? **Because the position was vacant and had been vacation they removed it.**
2. As a temporary reassignment, why can't we use the MCTV Director job classification? It is also a grade 19 when the exact same management responsibilities as General Manager. The reason that I know this is that, during our only meeting with District HR regarding comp and class five years ago, Bill Shedd and I were told that the MCTV Director position was identical to the General Manager position and that they were going to maintain the GM position so as to be able to eliminate the MCTV Director position in the new comp & class. **I have submitted an inquiry**
3. Most importantly, Maria, we are running a deficit in Sun Sounds and this situation has to be corrected through new management. As you know, we have to self-generate 95% percent of our revenue, and it cannot be done if District HR won't allow us to assign the proper personnel to manage the problem. **Should bring this issue to Chris during during the Exec Team meeting this afternoon?** I don't want to big foot this and thereby slow down the outcome, if you think we're close. However, on the other hand, District HR's failure to provide us with any answer other than "no" is harming the District, and I must say so at the proper time. **You can discuss with Chris, he wanted us to cover all our bases before he steps in.**



MARIA R. BELLINO, MSIO
RIO SALADO COLLEGE

Dean, Administrative & Employee Services

Rio Salado College 2323 W. 14th St

4805178220 | maria.bellino@

Paluzzi 000028

On Mon, Aug 14, 2017 at 9:35 AM, Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi2@rioradio.> wrote:

Hola Maria ... ¡muchísimas gracias!

I think it's rather interesting that District HR can say that the General Manager position is not in the job bank, as that was the position to which I was hired. So, evidently, someone removed the position from the job bank without consultation with Rio Salado or the Division of Public Service.

So, three questions:

1. Can they do that?

2. As a temporary reassignment, why can't we use the MCTV Director job classification? It is also a grade 19 when the exact same management responsibilities as General Manager. The reason that I know this is that, during our only meeting with District HR regarding comp and class five years ago, Bill Shedd and I were told that the MCTV Director position was identical to the General Manager position and that they were going to maintain the GM position so as to be able to eliminate the MCTV Director position in the new comp & class.

3. Most importantly, Maria, we are running a deficit in Sun Sounds and this situation has to be corrected through new management. As you know, we have to self-generate 95% percent of our revenue, and it cannot be done if District HR won't allow us to assign the proper personnel to manage the problem. **Should bring this issue to Chris during during the Exec Team meeting this afternoon?** I don't want to big foot this and thereby slow down the outcome, if you think we're close. However, on the other hand, District HR's failure to provide us with any answer other than "no" is harming the District, and I must say so at the proper time.

Your thoughts?

Thanks, again!

Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281**

(480) 834-5627

On Mon, Aug 14, 2017 at 7:52 AM,
Maria Bellino<maria.bellino@> wrote:
Jim, buenos dias!!

I spoke with the District late on Thursday and could not convince them regarding the General Manager temp reassignment for Linda as the position no longer exists in our current job description job bank, although it exists in the Class and Comp rollout. I did inquire about the direct hire allocations and I was advised they are pending. I inquired if we could do a direct hire to the new general manager position and they are considering. I will contact them again today. I'm sorry it is not better news.



MARIA R. BELLINO, MSIO
RIO SALADO COLLEGE

Dean, Administrative & Employee Services
Rio Salado College 2323 W. 14th St
4805178220| maria.bellino@
<https://www.riosalado.edu/>

Summer Hours: 5/15/17 - 8/11/17: Monday - Thursday, 7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., closed Fridays

On Fri, Aug 11, 2017 at 10:25 AM, Jim
Paluzzi <jpaluzzi2@rioradio.> wrote:

Hello Maria. Just checking in to see if you have heard anything regarding the temporary reassignment for Linda Pastori. We are well past the ten day service standard for District to approve these requests.

Also, do we have any news regarding the President's direct appointment allocations?

I know that Chris would like us to work through channels. However, if those channels are broken, please let me know if you think it's time for me to take these items directly to the president.

Thanks so much, y que tengas un buen fin de semana :)

Best regards
Jim

Sent from my BlackBerry - the most secure mobile device



Sept 5 memo

1 message

From: Jim Paluzzi

To: Chris Bustamante

Tuesday, Sept 5, 2017 at 12:06 PM

Thanks for the offer, Chris. Greatly appreciated!

Maria, since I will be leaving for the KJZZ Mexico City Donor Briefings tomorrow, could you please include Chris on any information you should receive prior to his meeting with LaCoya tomorrow?

I know that District will say that comp & class slowed down decision making. However, we have made it clear that we have an urgent situation here -- an urgent situation that has evolved over the past two months since we first requested *urgent consideration* into an *emergency*.

It is impossible to be self-supporting when are hands and feet are tied down with bureaucracy.

I know you understand this, and I want you to know how much we appreciate your tireless efforts on our behalf.

Thanks, again!!

Jim

James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627

On Tue, Sep 5, 2017 at 9:35 AM, Chris Bustamante <[REDACTED]> wrote:

All,

I meet with LaCoya tomorrow afternoon in my office on other topics but could ask her for additional assistance to expedite this request if it would help. Let me know.

Thanks, CB.

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 5, 2017, at 9:06 AM, Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi2@rioradio.org> wrote:

Thanks for the update, Maria.

Yes please advise on the direct appointment for Linda. We're rapidly approaching crisis mode at Sun Sounds, with Andrea being unable to come in regularly to the office -- due to issues with her father's health.

Fundraising there by Sun Sounds staff is virtually non-existent presently, which does not bode well for a department that is already several hundred thousand in the red.

We really, really, need Linda at the helm right now.
Thanks again, Maria, for all you do!!

Best,
Jim

James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627

On Tue, Sep 5, 2017 at 7:50 AM, Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@>wrote:
Jim, K. Brooks sent an update regarding the review of the modifications we sent in for the Associate General Managers. I will also follow up with them regarding Linda's direct hire appointment through a separate email.

MARIA R. BELLINO, MSIO
RIO SALADO COLLEGE
Dean, Administrative & Employee Services
2323 W. 14th St., Tempe, AZ 85281
(480) 517-8220
maria.bellino@riosalado.edu <https://www.riosalado.edu/>

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Kathy Brooks<kathy.brooks@domail.>
Date: Tue, Sep 5, 2017 at 7:39 AM
Subject: KJAZZ Request
To: Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@riosalado.edu>
Cc: Susan Krall <susan.krall@domail.maricopa.>, Travis Butchart <travis.butchart@domail.>

Maria,

I wanted to let you know that the team has not forgotten the review request you sent on KJAZZ. They needed to get through the reconsideration review before focusing on this request along with about five others. They will now be able to conduct those reviews and will be back to you as quickly as they can.

Thanks,
Kathy



Kathy Brooks, SPHR, SHRM-SCP
Associate Vice-Chancellor, HR Administration
2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281

Tell us how we're doing!

phone | 480-731-8441 fax | 480-731-8484

email | kathy.brooks@domail.

website | <https://www.maricopa.edu>



September 18 memo

1 message

From: Linda Thor
To: James Paluzzi

Monday, September 18, 2018 at 7:47 PM

Hi Jim,

Thanks again for inviting me to Mexico City. The briefing was fabulous!

I want to follow up on the concerns regarding the classification study. How many station employees appealed their classifications and how many were granted? Can you give me some examples of the disconnect between the actual jobs and the recommended classifications? Also, can you give me any examples of where specially funded employees are treated differently than fund 1 employees? Thanks!

Linda

Linda M. Thor, Ed.D.

Vice President, Maricopa Community Colleges Governing Board

President Emeritus, Rio Salado College

Chancellor Emeritus, Foothill-De Anza Community College District

LindaMThor@gmail.com

480-226-9176



Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi@gmail.com>

September 19 memo

1 message

Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi@gmail.com> Sun, May 6, 2018 at 7:37 PM

To: James Paluzzi <james.paluzzi@mac.com>

Linda, responding to your questions:

How many station employees appealed their classifications and how many were granted?

Six station employees individually appealed; none of their appeals were granted. One job description was modified. However, after "modification," this employee was still red-lined.

Can you give me some examples of the disconnect between the actual jobs and the recommended classifications?

On 5 July 2017 Rio Salado asked for management level reconsideration (a request from the President at the college level) for five senior managers -- all of whom were red-lined when Class and Comp lowered the maximum compensation for this class (unique to the Division of Public Service): Associate General Manager. (You may remember you authorized the creation these positions during my first three months at Rio Salado.)

We asked District to reclassify these employees as *Program Director*, which is a District-wide classification for senior level administrators.

Rio Salado had specifically asked for a meeting with District to discuss this situation. Here is District's response: (italics are mine)

On Thu, Jul 6, 2017 at 7:19 AM, KathyBrooks<kathy.brooks@>wrote:

Maria,

Please ask Jim to send us something in writing to articulate his need. He can use the management reconsideration form that we sent out. ***We unfortunately don't have the bandwidth to hold meetings with everyone wanting something to be considered.*** We will be happy to review his request but you should weigh in on it and agree with it prior to sending our way. Do keep in mind however that the reconsideration period, management or employee is intended only for classification reconsideration, not pay.

Thanks,

Kathy

Accordingly, we provided District with the attached documentation for each of the five employees that needed to be re-classed, along with copies of I-990 forms that must be filed with the Federal Internal Revenue Service

by non-profit organizations, including community licensed public radio stations.

These I-990 forms contain the salaries of each public radio station's senior staff. These documents demonstrate that -- compared to KJZZ's thirteen peer public radio stations -- all of KJZZ's Associate General Managers *are currently paid less* than their counterparts at KJZZ's peer public radio stations.

We also provided District with the attached PowerPoint to demonstrate the scope of our Division -- and to counter any notion that the Division of Public Service was "just a college radio station."

Nearly three months have passed, and we have yet to hear a response from District on this request.

Also, can you give me any examples of where specially funded employees are treated differently than fund 1 employees?

At present, there are at least two high profile issues for Specially Funded employees:

1. Specially Funded employees are not eligible for the ten year, twenty year, and thirty year bonus payments that Fund 1 employees receive.
2. Specially Funded employees receive less professional growth funding than Fund 1 employees:

from: Professional Growth Funds 2017-18 (District-wid3 email: 7 September

2017)

Amounts

The amounts per fiscal year until funds run out:

- Classified Staff - not to exceed \$4,000
- Specially Funded - not to exceed \$1,200

Often, the argument is made that many Specially Funded employees are funded by grants that may not have enough funding to pay for these benefits. Perhaps, then, it would be clearer to differentiate between Grant Funded and Locally Funded positions. Less than ten percent of our "Specially Funded" positions in the Division of Public Service are "Grant Funded," whereas ninety percent of our positions are "Locally Funded" through member and underwriting funds.

I hope this helps. As always, please do not hesitate to let me know if I can provide any additional information.

Thanks for all you do!

Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627**



Pay raise

1 message

From: Chris Bustamante
To: James Paluzzi <jpaluzzi2@rioradio.org>

Tuesday, Sep 26, 2017 at 11:18 AM

Oh, Jim...by the way...Did I forget to tell you that I gave you a raise? Well because I can and because of the fabulous job you are doing...and still doing it being the poorest paid of your colleagues nationally. 😊

You are appreciated! CB.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Lee Rachoy <lee.rachoy@riosalado.edu>
Date: September 26, 2017 at 11:51:49 AM EDT
To: Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi@rioradio.org>
Cc: Chris Bustamante <chris.bustamante@riosalado.>, "Anna Flores (Faculty)" <Anna.Flores@riosalado.edu>, Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@riosalado.edu>, Frankie Rachoy <lee.rachoy@riosalado.edu>
Subject: Pay adjustment
Reply-To: lee.rachoy@

Good morning Jim,

You have received a pay adjustment effective 9/23/2017. Your new Grade and step are 21/10 with a bi-weekly rate of \$6,015.65 and an annual rate of \$156,407.

Congratulations!



Lee Rachoy
Coordinator Human Resource Services/
Human Resources
Tel: 480/517-8176 | Fax: 480/ | lee.rachoy
@
2323 W. 14th Street Tempe, AZ
85281 | www.riosalado.edu

A Maricopa Community College



October 10 memo

1 message

Jim Paluzzi

Tuesday, October 10
at 7:56 AM

To: Maria Bellino

Hi Maria ... in our industry, a station can have only one general manager: one who is responsible for all of the operations of a station. The only way that I can see us having more than one general manager is if we have more than one station -- we have three.

I currently serve as GM of KJZZ and KBAQ in addition to my duties of VP, Public Service.

In short, I believe there is a world of difference between a GM and an AGM.

Could we think about how to fix the pay grade of the GM? Under class & comp, our present GM - Linda Pastori -- would be red lined.

Besides, I know of no General Manager for a major market public radio station that has so many development responsibilities that earns only

Paluzzi 000040

\$117,000 (the top end of 121). I'm thinking, when we compare the responsibilities of a General Manager against that of an Associate Dean, for example (also in the present system a Grade 19) we should try to move that GM position to the same as an Associate Dean -- to pay grade 123.

Or at least, 122.

I'm ready for another round with District on this. The question is when and how ...

Your thoughts?

Thanks,

Jim

James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627

On Mon, Oct 9, 2017 at 5:50 PM, Maria Bellino <maria.bellino@>wrote:

Jim, here's another idea. Since the GM will be a 121, what if we make your AGM's, GM's? There would only need to be a title change and of course added responsibilities per the job description. Just a thought....M

Hablamos después...M



MARIA R. BELLINO, MSIO
RIO SALADO COLLEGE

Dean, Administrative & Employee Services
2323 W. 14th St., Tempe, AZ 85281
(480) 517-8220

maria.bellino@riosalado.edu <https://www.riosalado.edu/>



October 20 memo

1 message

Jim Paluzzi
To: Anna Flores

Friday, Oct 20, 2017 at 4:46 PM

Hi Anna ... thanks for the heads-up.

On Monday this week, Dr. Bustamanate, Dr. Terry, and I met with Rob Schwing on a variety of issues.

In that meeting, Mr. Schwing told us that the Chancellor has said that there are three units in the District that are to receive expedited consideration through HR processes because of their revenue generation responsibilities:

- The MCCCD Foundation
- MCOR
- The Division of Public Service

Mr. Schwing also indicated that it is possible that this determination may not have filtered all the way through the rank and file in HR. Accordingly, I have been directed to channel any HR issues that will affect our ability to generate revenue to make payroll through the President, who will determine whether to take our issues to either the VCHR or directly to the Chancellor.

Accordingly, please advise as soon as you should hear more from District on this position. I am happy to meet with anyone in District to discuss this position.

It is mission critical to have this position filled as soon as possible, as this person will have significant transitional responsibilities. This person will serve as Executive Director of the Friends of Public Radio Arizona -- responsible for the management of our 501(c)3 foundation with a twenty member Board of Directors operating under a memorandum of understanding with the

Governing Board.

Thanks, Anna. As always, please do not hesitate to contact me should you have any questions -- or should you need additional documentation and/or justification.

Have a good weekend,

Jim

James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D.

Vice President, Division of Public Service, Rio Salado College

KJZZ/KBAQ/Sun Sounds/Spot 127-Youth Media Center

2323 W 14th St., Tempe, AZ 85281

(480) 834-5627

On Fri, Oct 20, 2017 at 2:33 PM, Anna Flores <anna.flores@riosalado.>wrote:

Hello,

I hope this message finds you doing well. We spoke on Monday about the posting of this position and you indicated that if you did not hear from me by that afternoon, that you would go ahead and contact Livingston about the search. I informed you that I did not expect any issues. I spoke with Comp yesterday about a different Rio position and they had some questions about the station's position. While I haven't heard back about the specific questions/issues they had, I wanted to give you a heads up about it. I will keep you updated.

Regards,
Anna



October 28 memo

1 message

From: Linda Thor
To: James Paluzzi

Sun, May 6, 2018 at 7:25 PM

Jim,

I finally received answers to the questions I posed regarding the classification study and treatment of specially funded employees. Please review the attached and let me know if you have significant disagreement with the information provided. Also, I would like to sit down with you and discuss what types of proposals i can put forward regarding policies for locally funded SFP employees in the area of professional growth, vacation accrual, etc. I would also like to address what I understand to be an inequity imposed when a regularly funded employee moves to specially funded and vice versa.

Thanks!

Linda

Linda M. Thor, Ed.D.

Vice President, Maricopa Community Colleges Governing Board

President Emeritus, Rio Salado College

Chancellor Emeritus, Foothill-De Anza Community College District

LindaMThor@gmail.com



----- Forwarded message -----

From: Maria Harper-Marinick<maria.harper@>

Date: Sat, Oct 28, 2017 at 12:40 PM
Subject: Re: Classification study appeals
To: Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com>
Cc: Laurin Hendrix <laurinh@cox.net>

Trying again, please see attached



Maria Harper-Marinick, Ph.D.
Chancellor
2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281
phone | (480) 731-8108 • fax | (480) 731-8120
cell | (480) 364-6744
email | maria.harper@domail.
website | www.maricopa.edu

On Sat, Oct 28, 2017 at 12:38 PM, Maria Harper-Marinick <maria.harper@>wrote:

Dr. Thor and Mr. Hendrix, Apologies again. Sent the message from my phone and just realized the attachment did not go through. Let me try to recreate the message now that I am at my computer.

Thanks



Maria Harper-Marinick, Ph.D.
Chancellor
2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281
phone | (480) 731-8108 • fax | (480) 731-8120
cell | (480) 364-6744
email | maria.harper@domail.
website | www.maricopa.edu

On Sat, Oct 28, 2017 at 8:56 AM, Linda Thor<lindamthor@gmail.com>

Chancellor,

Since we will be meeting with VC Shelton, I want to remind you that I have not received answers to the questions I posed on October 1. In addition, in a subsequent email I asked how many employees have been redlined in the new system.

I am beginning to understand why employees are frustrated about how long it takes to get a response from HR if they get a response at all. :-)

Linda M. Thor, Ed.D.

Vice President, Maricopa Community Colleges Governing Board

President Emeritus, Rio Salado College

Chancellor Emeritus, Foothill-De Anza Community College District

LindaMThor@gmail.com

480-226-9176

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Maria Harper-Marinick**<maria.harper@>

Date: Sun, Oct 1, 2017 at 7:43 AM

Subject: Re: Classification study appeals

To: Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com>

Cc: Laurin Hendrix <laurinh@cox.net>

Thank you, Dr. Thor. Will get responses for you asap.



Maria Harper-Marinick, Ph.D.

Chancellor

2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281

phone | (480) 731-8108 • fax | (480) 731-8120

cell | (480) 364-6744

email | maria.harper@domail.

website | www.maricopa.edu

On Sat, Sep 30, 2017 at 3:42 PM, Linda

Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com>

Chancellor,

As I mentioned to you, I asked Jim Paluzzi to respond to some questions regarding the classification appeals of radio station senior managers--all of whom have been red-lined. I also asked about disparate treatment of specially-funded employees.

Jim's responses are in blue in the attached message.

I am concerned on multiple levels: the threat to our ability to maintain our status as a premier public radio station if our salaries are not competitive; the lack of responsiveness by district HR; and the disparate treatment of specially-funded employees, particularly those that are not grant-funded but locally funded. As you will recall, I mentioned the impending retirement of Bill Shedd, a 32-year employee of the radio stations. Because he has been specially funded throughout his three decade career with Maricopa, he has never received the 10, 20 and 30 year stipends. This is shameful and I believe should be corrected retroactively before he retires. The disparity in professional growth funds should be corrected as well.

Additionally, I would like to receive the following information:

How many employees requested review of their new classification and how many adjustments were made?

What is the next level of appeal if HR denies a request?

Under the new system, will college administrators be able to adjust salaries of specially funded employees as they do now?

Please provide a comprehensive list of all disparities between how specially funded employees are treated compared to "regular" employees.

Please let me know if you have any questions or need clarification. Thanks!

Linda M. Thor, Ed.D.

Vice President, Maricopa Community Colleges Governing Board

President Emeritus, Rio Salado College

Chancellor Emeritus, Foothill-De Anza Community College

District

LindaMThor@gmail.com

480-226-9176

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Jim Paluzzi**<jpaluzzi2@rioradio.org>

Date: Tue, Sep 19, 2017 at 5:44 PM

Subject: Classification study appeals

To: Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com>

Linda, responding to your questions:

How many station employees appealed their classifications and how many were granted?

Six station employees individually appealed; none of their appeals were granted. One job description was modified. However, after "modification," this employee was still red-lined.

Can you give me some examples of the disconnect between the actual jobs and the recommended classifications?

On 5 July 2017 Rio Salado asked for management level reconsideration (a request from the President at the college level) for five senior managers -- all of whom were red-lined when Class and Comp lowered the maximum compensation for this class (unique to the Division of Public Service): Associate

General Manager. (You may remember you authorized the creation these positions during my first three months at Rio Salado.)

We asked District to reclassify these employees as *Program Director*, which is a District-wide classification for senior level administrators.

Rio Salado had specifically asked for a meeting with District to discuss this situation. Here is District's response: (italics are mine)

On Thu, Jul 6, 2017 at 7:19 AM, Kathy Brooks<kathy.brooks@> wrote:

Maria,

Please ask Jim to send us something in writing to articulate his need. He can use the management reconsideration form that we sent out. ***We unfortunately don't have the bandwidth to hold meetings with everyone wanting something to be considered.*** We will be happy to review his request but you should weigh in on it and agree with it prior to sending our way. Do keep in mind however that the reconsideration period, management or employee is intended only for classification reconsideration, not pay.

Thanks,
Kathy

Accordingly, we provided District with the attached documentation for each of the five employees that needed to be re-classed, along with copies of I-990 forms that must be filed with the Federal Internal Revenue Service by non-profit organizations, including community licensed public radio stations.

These I-990 forms contain the salaries of each public radio station's senior staff. These documents demonstrate that -- compared to KJZZ's thirteen peer public radio stations -- all of KJZZ's Associate General Managers *are currently paid less than* their counterparts at KJZZ's peer public radio stations.

We also provided District with the attached PowerPoint to demonstrate the scope of our Division -- and to counter any

notion that the Division of Public Service was "just a college radio station."

Nearly three months have passed, and we have yet to hear a response from District on this request.

Also, can you give me any examples of where specially funded employees are treated differently than fund 1 employees?

At present, there are at least two high profile issues for Specially Funded employees:

1. Specially Funded employees are not eligible for the ten year, twenty year, and thirty year bonus payments that Fund 1 employees receive.

2. Specially Funded employees receive less professional growth funding than Fund 1 employees:

from: Professional Growth Funds 2017-18 (District-wide email: 7 September 2017)

Amounts

The amounts per fiscal year until funds run out:

- Classified Staff - not to exceed \$4,000
- Specially Funded - not to exceed \$1,200

Often, the argument is made that many Specially Funded employees are funded by grants that may not have enough funding to pay for these benefits. Perhaps, then, it would be clearer to differentiate between Grant Funded and Locally Funded positions. Less than ten percent of our "Specially Funded" positions in the Division of Public Service are "Grant Funded," whereas ninety percent of our positions are "Locally Funded" through member and underwriting funds.

I hope this helps. As always, please do not hesitate to let me know if I can provide any additional information.

Thanks for all you do!

Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public
Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627**

Appendix C

October 29th Memo

October 29 memo

1 message

Jim Paluzzi <jpaluzzi@gmail.com>

To: Linda Thor

Hi Linda, thanks for your message!

I have reviewed the response from the VCHR, and find several discrepancies between what we have experienced and what was communicated to you.

Would it be OK if I took 24 hours to think through my responses? I specifically would like to comment on the "grading error" issue described in the memo as well as the statement:

Additionally, both Jim and Bill were very involved as subject matter experts in the development of the Broadcast Family.

I truly need to think through how to respond to *that* statement, as it is patently false: Bill and I met with District once in the past five years and that was over three years ago. When Kathy Brooks advised in writing (July 2017) that District HR "didn't have the bandwidth" to even meet with us on our issues, I don't see how anyone in District HR can say that we were "very involved as subject matter experts."

The problems that Rio Salado raised on behalf of our Division are only the tip of the iceberg there is an even broader issue of the preferential treatment that Information Technology Employees receive over Broadcast Engineering Employees particularly when they are doing similar work, or work that even more difficult (or dangerous) than comparable IT positions.

I am currently on leave, and will be back in the office on Tuesday, but I can have a response in your hands by COB tomorrow. Will that be ok?

As always, Linda, I am at your service, and will provide any information that you might request. Please let me know when you might be available to meet, and I we will schedule a time.

Thanks so much for all you do!

Best, Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 8345627**

On Sat, Oct 28, 2017 at 2:02 PM, Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com> wrote: Jim,

I finally received answers to the questions I posed regarding the classification study and treatment of specially funded employees. Please review the attached and let me know if you have significant disagreement with the information provided. Also, I would like to sit down with you and discuss what types of proposals i can put forward regarding

policies for locally funded SFP employees in the area of professional growth, vacation accrual, etc. I would also like to address what I understand to be an inequity imposed when a regularly funded employee moves to specially funded and vice versa.

Thanks! Linda

Linda M. Thor, Ed.D.

**Vice President, Maricopa Community Colleges Governing Board
President Emeritus, Rio Salado College
Chancellor Emeritus, FoothillDe Anza Community College District**

LindaMThor@gmail.com 4802269176

Forwarded message From: **Maria HarperMarinick**<maria.harper@domail.maricopa.edu>
Date: Sat, Oct 28, 2017 at 12:40 PM
Subject: Re: Classification study appeals
To: Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com>
Cc: Laurin Hendrix <laurinh@cox.net>

Trying again, please see attached

eSig Logo

Maria HarperMarinick, Ph.D.

Chancellor

2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281 phone | (480) 7318108 • fax | (480) 7318120 cell | (480) 3646744
email | maria.harper@domail.maricopa.edu website | www.maricopa.edu

On Sat, Oct 28, 2017 at 12:38 PM, Maria HarperMarinick <maria.harper@domail.maricopa.edu> wrote:

Dr. Thor and Mr. Hendrix, Apologies again. Sent the message from my phone and just realized the attachment did not go through. Let me try to recreate the message now that I am at my computer.

Thanks

eSig Logo

Maria HarperMarinick, Ph.D.

Chancellor

2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281 phone | (480) 7318108 • fax | (480) 7318120 cell | (480) 3646744
email | maria.harper@domail.maricopa.edu website | www.maricopa.edu

On Sat, Oct 28, 2017 at 8:56 AM, Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com> wrote: Chancellor,

Since we will be meeting with VC Shelton, I want to remind you that I have not received answers to the questions I posed on October 1. In addition, in a subsequent email I asked how many employees have been redlined in the new system.

<https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ui=2&ik=14b5c85fd2&jsver=OeNArYUPo4g.en.&view=pt&search=sent&th=163388ae8a088f01&siml=163388ae8a088f01> 2/6

5/6/2018 Gmail - October 29 memo

I am beginning to understand why employees are frustrated about how long it takes to get a response from HR if they get a response at all. :(

Linda M. Thor, Ed.D.

Vice President, Maricopa Community Colleges Governing Board
President Emeritus, Rio Salado College
Chancellor Emeritus, FoothillDe Anza Community College District

LindaMThor@gmail.com 4802269176

Forwarded message From: **Maria HarperMarinick**<maria.harper@domail.maricopa.edu>
Date: Sun, Oct 1, 2017 at 7:43 AM
Subject: Re: Classification study appeals
To: Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com>
Cc: Laurin Hendrix <laurinh@cox.net>

Thank you, Dr. Thor. Will get responses for you asap.

eSig Logo

Maria HarperMarinick, Ph.D.

Chancellor

2411 West 14th Street, Tempe AZ 85281 phone | (480) 7318108 • fax | (480) 7318120 cell | (480) 3646744
email | maria.harper@domail.maricopa.edu website | www.maricopa.edu

On Sat, Sep 30, 2017 at 3:42 PM, Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com> wrote: Chancellor,

As I mentioned to you, I asked Jim Paluzzi to respond to some questions regarding the classification appeals of radio station senior managers all of whom have been redlined. I also asked about disparate treatment of specially funded employees.

Jim's responses are in blue in the attached message..

I am concerned on multiple levels: the threat to our ability to maintain our status as a premier public radio station if our salaries are not competitive; the lack of responsiveness by district HR; and the disparate treatment of specially funded employees, particularly those that are not grant funded but locally funded. As you will recall, I mentioned the impending retirement of Bill Shedd, a 32 year employee of the radio stations. Because he has been specially funded throughout his three decade career with Maricopa, he has never received the 10, 20 and 30 year stipends. This is shameful and I believe should be corrected retroactively before he retires. The disparity in professional growth funds should be corrected as well.

Additionally, I would like to receive the following information:

How many employees requested review of their new classification and how many adjustments were made?
What is the next level of appeal if HR denies a request?

Under the new system, will college administrators be able to adjust salaries of specially funded employees as they do now?

Please provide a comprehensive list of all disparities between how specially funded employees are treated compared to "regular" employees.

Please let me know if you have any questions or need clarification. Thanks!

Linda M. Thor, Ed.D.

Vice President, Maricopa Community Colleges Governing Board

[https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?](https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ui=2&ik=14b5c85fd2&jsver=OeNArYUPo4g.en.&view=pt&search=sent&th=163388ae8a088f01&siml=163388ae8a088f01)

[ui=2&ik=14b5c85fd2&jsver=OeNArYUPo4g.en.&view=pt&search=sent&th=163388ae8a088f01&siml=163388ae8a088f01](https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ui=2&ik=14b5c85fd2&jsver=OeNArYUPo4g.en.&view=pt&search=sent&th=163388ae8a088f01&siml=163388ae8a088f01) 3/6

5/6/2018 Gmail - October 29 memo

**President Emeritus, Rio Salado College
Chancellor Emeritus, Foothill/De Anza Community College District**

LindaMThor@gmail.com 4802269176

Forwarded message From: **Jim Paluzzi**<jpaluzzi2@rioradio.org> Date: Tue, Sep 19, 2017 at 5:44 PM Subject: Classification study appeals

To: Linda Thor <lindamthor@gmail.com>

Linda, responding to your questions:

How many station employees appealed their classifications and how many were granted?

Six station employees individually appealed; none of their appeals were granted. One job description was modified. However, after "modification," this employee was still redlined.

Can you give me some examples of the disconnect between the actual jobs and the recommended classifications?

On 5 July 2017 Rio Salado asked for management level reconsideration (a request from the President at the college level) for five senior managers all of whom were redlined when Class and Comp lowered the maximum compensation for this class (unique to the Division of Public Service): Associate General Manager. (You may remember you authorized the creation these positions during my first three months at Rio Salado.)

We asked District to reclassify these employees as *Program Director*, which is a Districtwide classification for senior level administrators.

Rio Salado had specifically asked for a meeting with District to discuss this situation. Here is District's response: (italics are mine)

On Thu, Jul 6, 2017 at 7:19 AM, Kathy Brooks<kathy.brooks@domail.maricopa.edu> wrote:

Maria,

Please ask Jim to send us something in writing to articulate his need. He can use the management reconsideration form that we sent out. ***We unfortunately don't have the bandwidth to hold meetings with everyone wanting something to be considered.*** We will be happy to review his request but you should weigh in on it and agree with it prior to sending our way. Do keep in mind however that the reconsideration period, management or employee is intended only for classification reconsideration, not pay.

Thanks, Kathy

Accordingly, we provided District with the attached documentation for each of the five employees that needed to be reclassified, along with copies of I990 forms that

<https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ui=2&ik=14b5c85fd2&jsver=OeNArYUPo4g.en.&view=pt&search=sent&th=163388ac8a088f01&siml=163388ac8a088f01> 4/6

5/6/2018 Gmail - October 29 memo

must be filed with the Federal Internal Revenue Service by nonprofit organizations, including community licensed public radio stations.

These 1990 forms contain the salaries of each public radio station's senior staff. These documents demonstrate that compared to KJZZ's thirteen peer public radio stations all of KJZZ's Associate General Managers *are currently paid less than their counterparts at KJZZ's peer public radio stations.*

We also provided District with the attached PowerPoint to demonstrate the scope of our Division and to counter any notion that the Division of Public Service was "just a college radio station."

Nearly three months have passed, and we have yet to hear a response from District on this request.

Also, can you give me any examples of where specially funded employees are treated differently than fund 1 employees?

At present, there are at least two high profile issues for Specially Funded employees:

- 1. Specially Funded employees are not eligible for the ten year, twenty year, and thirty year bonus payments that Fund 1 employees receive.**
- 2. Specially Funded employees receive less professional growth funding than Fund 1 employees:**

from: Professional Growth Funds 201718 (Districtwid3 email: 7 September 2017)

Amounts

The amounts per fiscal year until funds run out:

- • **Classified Staff not to exceed \$4,000**
- • **Specially Funded not to exceed \$1,200**

Often, the argument is made that many Specially Funded employees are funded by grants that may not have enough funding to pay for these benefits. Perhaps, then, it would be clearer to differentiate between *Grant Funded* and *Locally Funded* positions. Less than ten percent of our "Specially Funded" positions in the Division of Public Service are "Grant Funded," whereas ninety percent of our positions are "Locally Funded" through member and underwriting funds.

I hope this helps. As always, please do not hesitate to let me know if I can provide any additional information.

Thanks for all you do!

Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio
Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 8345627**

Appendix D

October 30th Memo



October 30 memo

1 message

Jim Paluzzi
To: Linda Thor

Monday, October 30 at 7:10 AM

Good morning, Linda. Thanks, again, for your note. I'll provide you with a detailed response to the letter from the VCHR this week.

For your meeting today, a couple of thoughts:

1. In response to your question, we are ok with the recommended pay grade of 121 for the Associate General Managers. However, when I learned of that decision, I immediately advised Maria Bellino (she has Sharon Koberna's position) that Comp & Class demoted the General Manager position to the same pay grade 121 (some \$5,000 less than the present Step 10). When she advised District of this fact, District immediately raised the GM position to 122.

Without this change to 122, our General Manager for Sun Sounds and Development (Linda Pastori) would have also be red lined.

Was this another "grading error" in Comp & Class (with all of their sophisticated processes)??

2. There are some serious discrepancies in the letter that you received and actual practice regarding Specially Funded Employees:

a. "no access to grievance process or due process for termination"...
Board policy has provided for due process to the Chancellor for specially funded employees with three or more years of service.

b. "no performance evaluations required"... We were required by District to

perform performance evaluations on all of our Specially Funded employees this past year.

c. "no vacation accrual"... Specially Funded employees were receiving vacation accrual when you were Rio Salado President, and that practice continues to this day.

Good luck with your meeting today!

Best,

Jim

**James V. Paluzzi, Ph.D. | Vice President, Division of Public Service | Rio Salado College
2323 W 14th St. | Tempe, AZ | 85281
(480) 834-5627**

Appendix E

Complete Response

[note 1: black text was provided to a MCCC CD Governing Board Member by the Vice Chancellor for Human Resources through the Chancellor; bold colored text contains Paluzzi's comments]

[note 2: Specially funded employees are funded by sources other than taxpayer dollars. Eighty-one of the eighty-six full time employees in the Division of Public Service are specially funded. Fund 1 employees are funded by taxpayer dollars.]

Reconsideration Results

We had 687 individual reconsideration requests. The Committee reviewed all redacted requests. Of the 577 requests reviewed (110 of the admin requests were removed), 14.7% of the requests were approved. Consultants shared that they typically see 10% approved through a reconsideration window like this. We also offered a Management Reconsideration window prior to this where we received 580 requests and 367 were approved (or 63%).

Red Circle

In the current system, 563 employees are red-circled. In the new system 366 will be.

Comment: The use of the term Red-Circled is interesting. It is not the term that District HR uses with employees. Please note the email that I received on June 27, 2017 informing me of my status under Class & Comp:

To: Paluzzi, James Vincent

RE: Notification of Employment Classification Change Effective 10/16/2017

Maricopa's comprehensive classification and compensation study is nearing completion. The study was designed to create a valid, reliable classification system providing clear career paths while being responsive to the market.

Message truncated to save space - original available for review.

.... If you have specific questions about your individual situation, please contact your local Human Resources Department.

Thank you for your patience and participation throughout this process.

cc: Personnel file

**** Red-lined means your salary is above the maximum of the new salary range.**

NOTE: Please do not reply to this communication. Should you have questions about the content of this letter please contact your local Human Resources Department.

Many employees associate the term *Red-Lined* with *flat-lined*: a medical term that signifies death. Accordingly, it is easy to see why some employees who have been told that they are Red-Lined feel that they are metaphorically dead to the District - that they are not worth their salary. To make matters worse, District HR has not attempted to provide these staff members or their supervisors with any documentation to demonstrate why an employee should be "Red-Circled" or Red-Lined.

Appeals

Employee allocations have been reviewed in four instances throughout the reallocation process. The reconsideration window is intended to be the final leaving the system to settle into the new structure. The classification system is a "living" system that will

expand and contract as needed based on the evolution of skills needed and work performed.

Specially Funded

Specially funded employees have a specific policy manual. As per this policy manual, they are not eligible for 10, 20, 30 year anniversary awards. Specially funded positions are "at will" and do not have the same property rights that classified positions. **Ability for college administrators to adjust the pay of specially funded employees will be governed by those policies as adopted by the Governing Board.**

Comment: If the ability of college administrators to adjust the pay of specially funded employees is governed by those policies as adopted by the Governing Board, perhaps it may be appropriate for the Board to consider adopting a policy that specifically allows the college presidents to (1) adjust the pay of specially funded employees, and (2) pay specially funded employees 10, 20, and 30 year anniversary awards to achieve parity with Fund 1 employees (subject to available funding).

From a classification perspective and during the study, specially funded employees were not treated any differently. The focus of determining classification is based on the work performed not on the appointment type by way of at-will or classified status.

Additional differences between a Specially Funded and Classified employee include:

Salary placement, having no probation period, **no access to grievance process or due process for termination, no performance evaluations required, less professional growth, no funding for continuing education units (CEUs), no sabbatical or administrative leave, no internship, and no vacation accrual.**

Re: Due Process – on November 24, 2009 The Governing Board approved a policy change creating a procedure allowing due process hearings for all terminated employees who have worked more than half-time for three or more continuous years, effective Jan. 1, 2010 (see attachment). Until passage of this change, One Year Only, One Semester Only, Specially Funded Employees and Athletic Specialists were not eligible for a due process hearing prior to termination.

Re: Evaluations – the District required the Division of Public Service (and perhaps all specially funded units) to conduct performance evaluations during the past year.

**Re: Vacation accrual for specially funded employees – from the MCCC
Specially Funded Policy Manual/Effective July 1, 2011:**

7.6.2. Beginning January 1, 2007, specially funded employees will accrue the same number of vacation days and have the same vacation carryover rules as their counterparts in a regular Board-Approved Policy Group contingent that the funding source has the funds to pay the incumbent. Otherwise, no vacation will be accrued. Employees in these positions are eligible to rollover unused vacation hours into the next year. Specially funded employees whose employment is terminated or those who separate will be paid at the time in which the separation/termination occurs.

The KJZZ management reconsideration request was concluded this week. It is listed below. Since submittal, one update was sent on September 5th to the local HR department with the ask and expectation that the information be communicated to the requestor. One communication in an almost three-month period is unacceptable and will be addressed with the team.

Review Outcome

Jim Paluzzi's management reconsideration request was to move four employees allocated to the new Associate General Manager classification to a Program Director classification. The Program series, by design, was only intended for use if no other job series fit the duties/responsibilities. This was not the case with Broadcast jobs, which were created specifically for KJZZ, KBAQ, and MCTV. However, through this submission and one of the Employee Reconsideration Requests, it was uncovered that a grading error had occurred. Two of the jobs in the series were graded identically creating an internal inequity. After resolving this issue, the new grade for the Associate General Manager will be equal to the requested Program Director, which is grade 121.

Comment: There were, in fact, two grading errors. While the Associate General Managers were originally placed two grades below grade 121, the General Manager was also placed at pay grade 121 – some \$5,000 below current compensation at Grade 19, Step 10. So then, when District HR determined that there was a “grading error” with regard to the Associate General Managers, it then had to then raise the General Manager pay grade to 122 to avoid the obvious problem of paying the General Manager and the Associate General Managers the same salary. Additionally, without the adjustment of the General Manager to grade 122, our General Manager would have been red-lined, as well.

An additional request for Scott Williams was submitted. This employee is currently allocated to an Executive Assistant (MAT 18) classification as his duties differ from the other Associate GM's. Scott's responsibilities focus on analytics of listener data. Because of this, his position was originally assigned to the Program Manager classification. The Program Director class as requested for this individual based on his staff oversight and responsibilities does not meeting the Director definition, but could support a best fit as Associate General Manager in order to retain grade equity with the others in Jim's request.

We're hopeful that the majority of the issues with the proposed classifications were grade-based and not duties based since the series is an accurate reflection of current work performed and that the solutions outlined above resolve the issues raised by Jim (one of the six employees in KJZZ will be redlined). Additionally, **both Jim and Bill were very involved as subject matter experts in the development of the Broadcast Family.** One of the six employees in KJZZ will be redlined.

Comment: On September 27, 2013. Bill Shedd and I met with District HR staff members Susan Krall and Luane Shull to discuss “review of TV/Broadcast/Radio job class titling for Class/Comp Study.” It was the *only meeting* that we had with anyone with regard to the Class/Comp study. Whether one meeting four years ago constitutes being “very involved as subject matter experts in the development of the Broadcast Family” is debatable. During that single meeting, both Mr. Shedd and I raised the issue of talent in the classification process. Phoenix is in the 14th largest market in the United States. At KPCC, the public radio station licensed to Pasadena City College, there are three program hosts there that earn in excess of \$200,000 annually, according to I-990 forms which were supplied to the Internal Revenue Service. At Colorado Public Radio, a smaller market than Phoenix (19th), their morning program host earns in excess of \$100,000. By comparison, KJZZ's top program host is red-lined at \$89,000. How can we hope to attract and retain top talent to serve our community when our hands are tied? There is no other division in the District that depends as heavily on performance talent every day as the Division of Public Service, yet there is no provision in Class & Comp to provide for competitive salaries for our top broadcast performance talent.

Rio expressed that it disagrees with the "benchmarking" compensation practice for these positions and the outcome of matching this position to external jobs that have similar job content from third party survey sources. Our consulting partners, Arthur Gallagher, follow professionally accepted compensation standards as outlined by the Department of Labor, WorldatWork, and SHRM. In addition, they follow the Federal Trade Commission and U.S. Department of Labor's Sherman Antitrust Act guidelines regarding analysis of salary data. Salary data collected and used must be conducted by a reputable salary survey firm, data must not include self-reported data; and data collection must be conducted on a continual basis, not a one-time event. The submission of a partial copy of a few select tax forms (FORM 990) from other TV and Radio stations that indicate a name and job title for compensation of officers, directors, trustees, key employees, etc. does not fit the definition of market benchmarking. In addition, industry standard practice for benchmarking is not performed based on job title, but rather by a review of job duties.

Comments: At District HR's request, the Division of Public Service provided through Rio Salado College the best documentation that we could provide to substantiate the problems caused by our Associate General Managers being red-lined, based in large part on the fact that both Mr Shedd and I individually possess more than 40 years experience in broadcasting. We selected as documentation positions at other public radio stations for which we have first-hand knowledge of the duties and responsibilities as subject matter experts. As can be seen below, District HR responded to our request for a meeting to discuss this issue with a refusal to meet and a directive to "send us something in writing," without any guidance as to what would meet their standard for review.

On Thu, Jul 6, 2017 at 7:19 AM, Kathy Brooks <kathy.brooks@domail.maricopa.edu> wrote:

Maria,

Please ask Jim to send us something in writing to articulate his need. He can use the management reconsideration form that we sent out. We unfortunately don't have the bandwidth to hold meetings with everyone wanting something to be considered. We will be happy to review his request but you should weigh in on it and agree with it prior to sending our way. Do keep in mind however that the reconsideration period, management or employee is intended only for classification reconsideration, not pay.

Thanks,

Kathy

The statement District HR makes above, suggesting that salary information provided to the Internal Revenue Service on I-990 forms "does not fit the definition of market benchmarking," seems somewhat hollow, when one considers that none of the "benchmarking" data derived from consulting partners Arthur Gallagher's "professionally accepted compensation standards" has been provided to either the Division of Public Service or to the Rio Salado Dean of Administrative & Employee Services.

The denigration of our efforts to comply with District HR's directive – using HR consultant jargon – has the effect of placing us in a problematic position.

Recommendations:

- Employees assigned to Broadcast Associate General Manager remain allocated to the job class with the adjusted pay grade assignment to 121 (Same pay grade as was requested under Program Director)
- Scott Williams be allocated to the same job classification of Broadcast Associate General Manager and use working title. This is a best fit allocation to retain equity with other employees in Jim's area; the position does not fit the definition of a Director under the new class structure.

These recommendations were provided to Rio last week. Indications are that they will be satisfactory while maintaining equity and integrity of classification system. Should further discussion occur or additional consideration be requested, I will be sure to inform you.